UNITED
NATIONS

E

Economic and Social
Council

Distr.
GENERAL

E/CN.4/Sub.2/1992/SR.16
5 January 1993

ENGLISH
Original: FRENCH

COMMISSION ON HUMAN RIGHTS

SUB-COMMISSION ON PREVENTION OF DISCRIMINATION AND
PROTECTION OF MINORITIES

Forty-fourth session

SUMMARY RECORD OF THE 16th MEETING

Held at the Palais des Nations, Geneva,
on Friday, 14 August 1992, at 10 a.m.

Chairman: Mr. ALFONSO MARTINEZ

CONTENTS

Question of the violation of human rights and fundamental freedoms, including policies of racial discrimination and segregation and of apartheid, in all countries, with particular reference to colonial and other dependent countries and territories: report of the Sub-Commission under Commission on Human Rights resolution 8 (XXIII) (continued)

This record is subject to correction.

Corrections should be submitted in one of the working languages. They should be set forth in a memorandum and also incorporated in a copy of the record. They should be sent within one week of the date of this document to the Official Records Editing Section, room E.4108, Palais des Nations, Geneva.

Any corrections to the records of the public meetings of the Sub-Commission at this session will be consolidated in a single corrigendum, to be issued shortly after the end of the session.

GE.92-13257 (E)

The meeting was called to order at 10.20 a.m.

QUESTION OF THE VIOLATION OF HUMAN RIGHTS AND FUNDAMENTAL FREEDOMS, INCLUDING POLICIES OF RACIAL DISCRIMINATION AND SEGREGATION AND OF APARTHEID, IN ALL COUNTRIES, WITH PARTICULAR REFERENCE TO COLONIAL AND OTHER DEPENDENT COUNTRIES AND TERRITORIES: REPORT OF THE SUB-COMMISSION UNDER COMMISSION ON HUMAN RIGHTS RESOLUTION 8 (XXIII) (agenda item 6) (continued) (E/CN.4/Sub.2/1992/13; E/CN.4/Sub.2/1992/14; E/CN.4/Sub.2/1992/39; E/CN.4/Sub.2/1992/40; E/CN.4/Sub.2/1992/41; E/CN.4/1993/3-E/CN.4/Sub.2/1992/42; E/CN.4/1993/5-E/CN.4/Sub.2/1992/43; E/CN.4/Sub.2/1992/45; E/CN.4/Sub.2/1992/NGO/4; E/CN.4/Sub.2/1992/NGO/6; E/CN.4/Sub.2/1992/NGO/8)

1. Mrs. AHMED (General Arab Women Federation) said that under Commission on Human Rights resolution 1992/39, non-selectivity, integrity and objectivity were guiding principles in human rights, peoples had the right to determine their political status freely without external interference and it was the duty of every State to respect the territorial integrity of other States.

2. She deplored the repression to which Palestinian women had been subjected for over a quarter of a century by the Israeli occupation authorities, who, according to the Sub-Commission (resolution 1991/6), were guilty of gross violations of the rights of the Palestinian people through deliberate murder of Palestinians, including children, breaking the limbs of young people, imposing harsh living conditions in towns and villages, firing gas bombs inside houses, mosques, churches and hospitals, and beating up pregnant women. Immediate action was needed to put an end to such practices.

3. In Iraq, the right to life of women and children was under threat owing to the lack of food and medicine resulting from the economic blockade imposed in August 1990 and maintained since for purely political motives despite its serious humanitarian repercussions. Immediate action was imperative. Humanitarian organizations and human rights bodies must address the tragedy facing Iraqi women and children and recommend that the blockade be lifted to end their sufferings.

4. Mrs. GRAF (International League for the Rights and Liberation of Peoples) said that the League had, since its inception, been concerned with the right of peoples to self-determination. That right, however, did not necessarily imply the creation of new States or the redrawing of frontiers. That was why, for instance, the League had at the previous session of the Commission held that the secession of Croatia and Slovenia had by no means solved the problem of peaceful coexistence among the peoples of the region and was likely to provoke further nationalist claims. Furthermore, no consideration had yet been given to the desire of the Albanian population of Kosovo for independence, an aspiration no less justifiable than the others.

5. The League knew from experience that until victory had been won on the ground, often at a cost of hundreds of thousands of lives, many liberation movements and freedom fighters continued to be called terrorists or bandits by oppressors and those who supported them on the diplomatic front frequently excoriated.

6. As for the 25 million Kurds, their existence as a people was not only denied, and whatever side of the frontier they found themselves they were repressed, persecuted and exploited as political circumstance and the economic interests of the moment dictated.

7. In Turkey, for example, despite the fact that the use of the Kurdish language had been officially authorized in 1991, about a hundred people had been questioned by the police for singing in Kurdish at a wedding and two of them, Abdurrahman Dayan and Abdulgaffur Aksoy, had been detained and charged.

8. The Turkish authorities had a vast array of repressive weaponry at its command, such as the Act against Terrorism. Article 8 of that Act had served as a basis for bringing further charges against Ismail Besikci, a well-known intellectual who had already been sentenced to 12 years' imprisonment for raising the Kurdish question.

9. Although the Government coalition in power since October 1991 had undertaken to comply with the Paris Declaration of the CSCE by adapting the Constitution to meet the requirements of international law, the public prosecutor at the Court of State Security in Ankara had sought to have the parliamentary immunity of 22 Kurdish deputies withdrawn on the pretext that both they and the Kurdistan Workers' Party (PKK) were seeking to break up the State. Under article 125, paragraph 2, of the Criminal Code, those members of parliament could face the death penalty.

10. Immediately after the new Government had taken office, the forces of law and order had attacked some 20,000 people attending funerals at Kulp and Lice in the province of Diyarbakir, killing 16 and wounding many more. Also at Diyarbakir, 210 students had been arrested by the police after the May Day celebrations. Seven inhabitants of the village of Izar (Haci Akar, Besir Gündüz, Ahmet Duran, Yusuf Keles, Emin Akar, Tevfik Akar, Ceçen Seydin and Abdullah Akar) in the region of Dargeçit were said to have been injured during their torture by members of the Turkish armed forces.

11. Following guerrilla attacks on the garrisons at Isikveren and Tasdelen, the Turkish armed forces had shot 4 inhabitants of Kalemli: Tahir Onver aged 17, Muhsin aged 20, Halil Mina aged 55 and Xami aged 70.

12. In the town of Sirnak, over a hundred thousand people meeting peacefully to celebrate the Kurdish New Year had come under savage attack by artillery and even aircraft: over 100 had been reported dead, 500 injured, 2,000 arrested and 1,500 imprisoned. (The League could provide any interested person with the list of victims.)

13. If a solution was to be sought through peaceful means, an end would have to be put to the state of emergency and emergency powers which constituted a violation of human rights in Kurdistan, the anti-guerrilla forces and special units disbanded, mass imprisonment and torture ended, all acts of repression against the Kurdish language halted and a genuinely democratic constitution drawn up.

14. The Kurds had a right to decide their future freely. The Kurds of Turkey, had for their part, put forward proposals for negotiated and peaceful settlements on a number of occasions. Such proposals deserved a hearing.

15. Mr. ROBERT (Movement against Racism and for Friendship among Peoples - MRAP) said that colonialism and segregation still prevailed in South Africa as evidenced by the continued existence of Bantustans and townships. Absolute equality, the determining criterion of emancipation, must be established in that country.

16. The situation in the territories occupied by Israel was also a clear illustration of the link between the colonial system and human rights abuse: the uprooting of fruit trees, demolition of the houses of suspects and military repression were measures which went back to British colonial legislation.

17. As for the self-determination of the Kurdish people, the question of the Kurds of Turkey was not just a humanitarian one and the underlying political problem could not be evaded indefinitely. MRAP therefore urged the Sub-Commission to call for the cessation of military repression, an end to the state of emergency, the freeing of political prisoners and the cessation of legal proceedings, the introduction of genuine freedom of expression, and the establishment of a parliamentary commission, in which Kurdish deputies would participate, to arrange for a referendum. Lastly, MRAP asked the Sub-Commission to establish a commission of inquiry with powers to intervene from the start of the peace process and throughout the period of consultation.

18. As far as Western Sahara was concerned, the United Nations was responsible for organizing the vote on self-determination accepted in principle by both parties. However, MRAP was concerned about the fate of Saharan prisoners, whether prisoners of war or political detainees, on whom no information had been forthcoming from the Moroccan authorities. The other party to the conflict had stated its willingness to free the prisoners it detained but claimed that the Moroccan army refused to accept them.

19. Mr. Ramos-Horta, representing all movements and parties engaged in the struggle for the independence of East Timor, would describe the situation prevailing in that part of the world.

20. Mr. RAMOS-HORTA (Movement against Racism and for Friendship among Peoples - MRAP) recalled that the right of the people of East Timor to self-determination and independence had been brazenly denied by Indonesia since it had invaded that country on 7 December 1975. Eight United Nations General Assembly resolutions and two Security Council resolutions, in particular resolution 384 of 22 December 1975 calling on the Indonesian Government to withdraw all its forces from East Timor "without delay", had so far been ignored.

21. In 1974, the population of East Timor had stood at 700,000 with an annual population growth of 2.3 per cent. If that rate had been maintained, it would have produced a population of almost 1 million at the present day. Yet Indonesia's own statistics indicated a population of only 650,000, of whom 100,000 to 150,000 were Indonesian immigrants, leading to the conclusion

that the indigenous population was currently no more than 500,000. The figures showed that the Indonesian Government was intent on destroying the people of East Timor as a distinct group. Various means were employed to that end: physical elimination, mass killings, executions, forced sterilization of women, deportation and displacement of peoples and their replacement by Indonesians.

22. In June 1974, Mr. Adam Malik, Indonesian Minister for Foreign Affairs, stated that every nation had the right to independence, including the people of East Timor. In December 1975, Indonesia had invaded East Timor. In August 1991, the Indonesian delegation had given its word to the Sub-Commission that the Government of Indonesia would cooperate fully in the improvement of the human rights situation in East Timor. On 12 November 1991, the Chief of the Indonesian Armed Forces, General Try Sutrisno had cold-bloodedly orchestrated the massacre at Dili. Unknown to him, a British cameraman had been among the crowd. The impartiality of the Military Commission ordered to investigate the massacre was open to question. It was as if Mr. Pol Pot were to investigate charges of human rights abuse against the Khmer Rouge.

23. The Sub-Commission should not close its eyes to the tragedy of the people of East Timor. The independence movements in East Timor were willing to engage in a process of dialogue without preconditions, under United Nations auspices, to explore all possible ideas towards a solution.

24. Mrs. MANN (World Organization against Torture) expressed concern over the plight of Palestinian political detainees in the territories occupied by Israel. They were held in insalubrious conditions in unhygienic and overcrowded cells, food was inadequate and some did not receive the urgent medical treatment they required. Methods of interrogation were particularly brutal and included electric shock treatment, beatings, sleep deprivation, threats and solitary confinement. Some were held without charge in military detention centres for a period of six months, renewable indefinitely.

25. The use of force by the Israeli security forces was also a matter of concern. From the start of the intifada to the end of December 1991, 810 Palestinians had been killed. During the first 3 months of 1992, 33 Palestinians had been killed by gunfire.

26. The World Organization against Torture called on the Sub-Commission to urge the Israeli Government to respect the obligations it had undertaken in ratifying, on 4 August 1991, the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment.

27. The situation in Bangladesh, particularly in the Chittagong Hill Tracts, gave cause for alarm. Before 1964, that area had been populated solely by tribal peoples and migration to the Tracts had been forbidden by a British colonial regulation adopted in 1900. In 1964, the Pakistani Government had abolished that special status and non-tribal peoples were encouraged to settle in the area. With the establishment of Bangladesh in 1971, the new Government upheld the abolition of the special status and between 1971 and 1987 some 300,000 Bengalis had settled in the area. Attempts by tribal leaders to have the regulation of 1900 restored had led to violence, and at the present

time the Chittagong Hill Tracts were virtually under military control. Since 1972, the Government of Bangladesh had been involved in a massive military action that had led to the deaths of thousands of people protesting against the resettlement. There had been continuing violation of the rights of tribal peoples, including rape, torture, murder, summary execution and forced relocation of the tribal population.

28. On 21 June 1992, there had been a general strike in Dhaka during which the police injured 25 journalists, 3 of them seriously. The World Organization against Torture urged the Government of Bangladesh to respect constitutional rights and to try to find a political solution to the problem of the Chittagong Hill Tracts.

29. In Thailand, 500 to 700 people were said to be still missing following the crushing of the pro-democracy demonstrations. She appealed to the Thai authorities to investigate what had happened to those persons and to rescind the amnesty decreed on 13 May 1992 by the former Prime Minister, General Suchinda Kraprayoon, so that those responsible for the violence might be brought to trial.

30. According to the Special Rapporteur on torture in East Timor, torture was commonplace. On 12 November 1991, between 75 and 200 people had been massacred at Dili. The bodies of the victims had not been returned to their families, who lived in fear of arrest and interrogation themselves. No judicial or police inquiry had taken place. The military who had opened fire on the demonstrators had received very light sentences - one year at most - while some demonstrators had received sentences of from eight years to life. The World Organization against Torture appealed to the Government of Indonesia to conduct a judicial inquiry and bring those responsible to trial.

31. In El Salvador, the situation continued to give concern despite the efforts to restore peace. Three trade union activists had recently been killed, probably by "death squads". Other trade unionists had received death threats while others had been subjected to judicial proceedings for having exercised their fundamental rights.

32. The Government of El Salvador should respect fundamental human rights and the peace agreements, particularly the clauses pertaining to implementation of human rights mechanisms. It should also cooperate with the International Truth Commission set up by the United Nations to investigate the serious human rights violations which had taken place during the 12 years of civil war.

33. In Sri Lanka, there were reports of police violence, deaths in detention and attacks on the press and opposition political parties. Since June 1990, 6,000 people had been reported as missing in the Eastern Province alone. The Sub-Commission should put the question of human rights in Sri Lanka back on its agenda.

34. In Zaire, despite the announcement of the process of democratization in 1990, violence had increased, as demonstrated by the massacre at Lumumbashi during the night of 11 to 12 May 1990 and again by the massacre of 30 people at Kinshasa on 16 February 1992. Members of church and human rights groups and journalists had been threatened. People had disappeared, others were

being held in inhuman conditions in camps such as Kokolo and Irebu. The Government of Zaire should take all necessary measures to put an end to such violations.

35. In Lebanon, the Lebanese authorities and the occupying Syrian and Israeli armed forces made systematic use of torture. Such practices should cease and the amnesty for all acts committed between 1975 and 1991 revoked so that those responsible for human rights violations might be brought to justice.

36. Mr. SATYARTHI (Anti-Slavery International) said that, as the Chairman of the South Asian Coalition on Child Servitude, he was speaking for the over 80 million children in servitude on the Indian sub-continent. Despite constitutional provisions, specific laws, and the Sub-Commission's recommendations on the subject, no real steps had been taken to eliminate the exploitation of child labour and bonded labour in Bangladesh, India, Nepal, Pakistan and Sri Lanka. Admittedly, a law had been enacted during the current year in Pakistan to abolish bonded labour, but signs of implementation had yet to appear.

37. He recalled the tragic events which had taken place in the State of Madhya Pradesh, India, on 31 May 1992; five bonded children, who together with their families had fled into the forests of Raisen district, had lost their way and died of thirst and hunger, while five other members of the group had yet to be traced. Thousands of other children disappeared in the same way.

38. The children engaged in the carpet industry in India, Pakistan and Nepal were among the worst victims. To highlight the plight of the million and more of such children aged 6 to 12 years and to formulate an action programme, the First South Asian Seminar on Carpet Child Labour had been held in New Delhi on 11-13 July 1992. In addition to 50 eminent jurists, activists, academics, the Director of Anti-Slavery International and other prominent figures, 8 freed bonded child labourers had also been present, whose testimonies had provided the basis for most of the deliberations. The youngest, Mangla Prasad (aged 7) from Mirzapur, India, who had been in bondage for three years, had been forced to work 14 hours a day. If he was sick or slow at his work, he was beaten. He was also threatened with death if he tried to run away. Another boy, Ramkesth (aged 8), from Palamu, Bihar, had lost his sight during his four years of bonded labour.

39. The seminar estimated that India, Nepal and Pakistan accounted for over two thirds of the world trade in carpets. Seventy per cent of the workforce in that sector were children under the age of 14. There were 300,000 of them in India, 500,000 in Pakistan and 200,000 in Nepal, living and working in subhuman conditions. It was noteworthy that the same number of adult members of such children's families were unemployed. It would appear that children were preferred because of their physical and mental vulnerability. They were unable to oppose their exploitation, form trade unions or appeal to the courts.

40. All reports on the subject indicated gross violations of national and international norms. In the three countries cited, working conditions were particularly deplorable: children lived and worked in squalid loom sheds, toiling from 12 to 16 hours a day, 7 days a week; health problems were common,

among them respiratory disorders, anaemia, tuberculosis, skin diseases, cuts, deformation of the spine and loss of sight. Punishment was frequent: beatings, hunger, cigarette burns. Girls suffered the worst abuses: multiple rape, sexual rape and sale to brothels were common at Mirzapur and Bhadohi in India, in the outskirts of Kathmandu in Nepal and at Peshawar and Lahore in Pakistan. In those three countries girls were in the majority in the carpet industry, which often served as a cover for another trade: in Pakistan the carpet industry was a recruiting ground for young brides for the Gulf area, in Nepal girls - mainly from the Tamong community - were sold to brothels in India. That form of trafficking was reported to have affected 5,000 to 6,000 girls aged 10 to 14 during the past 5 years. In addition, Nepalese children were reported to have been imported into India to work in the carpet industry. There were believed to be over 20,000 of them in the Bhadohi region.

41. In the wake of the seminar, a consumer awareness campaign was launched in Germany and other European countries against the purchase of carpets made with child labour. Some positive results had already been achieved in India, where manufacturers had agreed to the release and repatriation of child labourers, but practical results were still awaited.

42. The seminar had also picked out three areas for immediate action at the regional level: the trafficking of girls from the carpet industry to neighbouring countries; the inter-country and inter-State migration of child labour; and child bonded labour.

43. Recalling the recommendations made by the Sub-Commission in 1990, with the exception of the new law on the abolition of bonded labour in Pakistan, which still had to be implemented, he pointed out that almost all action on bonded labour to date had been instigated by non-governmental organizations. Nothing had been done in India and Nepal, where the situation was deteriorating. Anti-Slavery International was urging action on two fronts: the establishment in the countries affected of national bodies, on which the Government, legal experts and non-governmental organizations were represented, to identify, release and rehabilitate all bonded labour; and the affixing of a label to all carpets to certify their production without the use of child labour. The latter measure should be undertaken in collaboration with non-governmental organizations, manufacturers, importers and Government departments.

44. Since 1989, South Asian countries had observed a Children in Servitude Day on 18 September each year. In 1992 the day has been designated as Carpet Children's Day. A delegation from the Working Group was invited to participate in the observation of that Day.

45. Mrs. TOJ (International Indian Treaty Council) paid a tribute to the practical assistance given by the Sub-Commission to indigenous peoples, who for five centuries had been marginalized, exterminated and reduced to destitution. She hoped that in 1993, the International Year for the World's Indigenous People, proper respect would at last be paid to the rights and identities of indigenous peoples, an act only possible through recognition of their human rights.

46. In East Timor, in particular, the Indonesian Government was instituting a policy of actual physical extinction - massacres, executions, forced sterilization of women and forced resettlement - that could be termed genocide. For example, in 1974 East Timor had had a population of 700,000. With an annual population growth of 2.3 per cent, that figure should have increased to one million at present, but was instead a mere 650,000, of whom 100,000 to 150,000 were Indonesians. The indigenous population thus amounted to only 500,000. The Indonesian Government systematically denied East Timor the right to self-determination despite the frequent recognition of that right in United Nations and Security Council resolutions.

47. Human rights were also being violated in Guatemala, where repressive acts against any who showed their dissatisfaction with the situation were on the increase. All forms of physical and psychological repression were current: threats, intimidation, persecution, slander, kidnapping, torture, summary execution and deportation.

48. To counter such repression, the victims - in particular the indigenous peoples - had formed an association to speak out for the many victims of human rights abuse and to propose specific measures to bring the situation to an end. One task was to combat the immunity enjoyed by those responsible for such abuse and to call for the establishment of a commission to investigate the fate of thousands of missing persons. The association also sought to have the procedures employed by the army to keep communities under observation abolished and to have compensation for damages introduced, to be paid for out of the celebrated peace dividend. It also sought assurances from the Government that it would no longer engage in acts of repression.

49. Those demands were endorsed by society at large, which also gave its backing to the process of political negotiation between the Government and the Unidad Revolucionaria Nacional Guatemalteca (URNG), in which negotiations human rights assumed special importance.

50. Society as a whole also demanded direct involvement in that process, of which human rights was an indivisible part. In the same way, an attack had to be made on the economic, social and political causes of injustice, oppression, discrimination and repression, which had given rise to the domestic armed conflict.

51. For the indigenous peoples, in particular, there could be no peace as long as the Government and the army behaved in an intolerant and violent way towards them refusing them a part in the negotiation process through recognition of their identity and their collective rights.

52. The apparent political will displayed by the Government and the army had raised hopes among the international community at a time when a new wave of repression seemed to be breaking over Guatemala. The Guatemalan people expected much from whatever resolutions the Sub-Commission might adopt. In that context, the International Indian Treaty Council was acting as a spokesman for a number of specific requests from the Guatemalan people, who hoped the Sub-Commission would in particular adopt a resolution acknowledging the real situation in Guatemala, including that of the indigenous peoples. It also hoped the Sub-Commission would call for the immediate disbanding of the

civil self-defence committees in accordance with the wish of the Guatemalan people and in accordance with the resolution adopted by the Commission on Human Rights on 5 March 1992 and with the recommendations of the Independent Expert. It further requested the Sub-Commission to endorse the establishment of machinery to monitor human rights which might take the form of an international commission that would include representatives of the Maya people, who would thus be in a position to ensure that their rights were respected. The Government and the security forces should be required to respect human rights fully in practice and not just in theory, and the Government Procurator's Office should keep an impartial watch on observance of human rights throughout the country. The Government should also be required to respect the decisions of indigenous communities invoking their right to remain on their land or to return to their homes and rebuild them. Those returning to their homes of their own volition should not be compelled to take part in the PAC and should have access to international humanitarian assistance. More particularly, the Maya people of Guatemala urged democratic Governments throughout the world to provide the support needed to ensure that the negotiations between the Government and the army, on one side, and URNG, on the other continued since the Maya people suffered most in the domestic armed conflict. The Sub-Commission was asked to send a delegation to Guatemala to observe the plight of the indigenous peoples and to report on the subject to the Commission on Human Rights and the United Nations General Assembly. It would in that way contribute to the defence of human rights in Guatemala in the context of the International Year for the World's Indigenous People.

53. Mr. SANDERS (International Work Group for Indigenous Affairs and Anti-Slavery International) reported on the situation in the Chittagong Hill Tracts as co-chairman of the Chittagong Hill Tracts Commission, which had visited the area with the cooperation of the Government of Bangladesh in December 1990. The Commission had published its report in May 1991 and an update in March 1992.

54. Unlike the rest of Bangladesh, where Bengalis were in the majority, the hill tracts were the traditional home of peoples differing from them racially, religiously and economically. The hill peoples had been protected since colonial times from outside settlers. Contrary to what the representative of the World Organization against Torture had said, the regulation of 1990 protecting the hill tracts had not been repealed in 1964 and it remained in force, according to the report on Bangladesh considered the previous week by the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination.

55. One reason for the current unrest in the region had been the Kaptai hydro-electric project, which by flooding a rich agricultural valley had uprooted one third of the tribal population (without adequate compensation). Another was the Government policy of settling Bengalis in the region. Contrary to Government claims, the hill people were not nomadic, holding land ownership documents valid under Bangladesh law, national rights and the provisions of ILO Convention No. 170, to which Bangladesh was a signatory.

56. The resultant displacement of population had not taken place peacefully. The hill people had responded to attacks by the military and by settlers by creating an armed resistance group, the Shanti Bahini, and a political party,

the JSS; the Bangladesh Government had increased militarization of the area. Military officials were currently engaged in economic development, distribution of relief, building infrastructure and even the settlement of land disputes, for which they had no formal authority under Bangladesh law.

57. The violence rife in the area had produced a refugee population of over 50,000 in the Indian State of Tripura. Attacks on hill people were followed by retaliatory attacks, which the military were currently preventing by the forcible relocation and regrouping of the population. That strategy had meshed with a rubber plantation project operating with Asian Development Bank funding, but that had since been ended.

58. The Government had recently adopted a new policy of prohibiting further new settlement in the hills and preventing retaliatory attacks by the military in order to isolate the Shanti Bahini as the only perpetrator of violence in the area. The latter aim had failed, however, since attacks by the military and settlers had continued, the last major incident occurring on 10 April 1992, in the village of Logang, where, according to Amnesty International, several hundred hill people had been killed. The Bangladesh Government had appointed a judge to investigate the incident as it had done on two other occasions, but the reports of those investigations had never been made public.

59. The Prime Minister of Bangladesh, Mrs. Khaleda Zia, had said that she favoured a political rather than a military solution and had appointed a nine-member committee to consider the matter. However, the three members of parliament for the Chittagong Hill Tracts, not being members of her political party, had been excluded from it.

60. The action he considered appropriate would be firstly to demilitarize the Chittagong Hill Tracts and turn over non-military functions, such as economic development, to non-military authorities.

61. The issue of land titles should be addressed by an impartial body. Refugees would not return to the region unless they could re-establish themselves on their traditional lands. Bengali settlers would be displaced in that process since many were living on stolen land. Foreign assistance should be available for the rehabilitation of such families.

62. Secondly, the Chittagong Hill Tracts should have sufficient autonomy within Bangladesh.

63. Lastly, the international community should monitor the situation; it was imperative that a special rapporteur should be appointed for the purpose.

64. Mr. MASRI (Observer for Syria), paying a tribute to the work done by the Sub-Commission, called its attention to infringements of the human rights established in international humanitarian agreements, which were particularly grave in that they were prompted by racist ideologies and settlement practices, as in the case in South Africa and Israel. Human rights organizations should give particular attention to such violations, which constituted some of the most flagrant breaches of human rights in that they attacked the fundamental freedoms, culture and identity of peoples.

65. The deterioration of the human rights situation in the territories occupied by Israel, such as the Syrian Golan and South Lebanon, was proceeding at an alarming pace. There was evidence in those territories of a determination to alter the population mix in the region and to expel Arabs from their land in flagrant violation of their most basic human rights.

66. As the Special Committee to Investigate Israeli Practices had stressed in its report (A/46/522), the occupation itself was a violation of human rights. Israel refused to withdraw from the occupied territories, to respect the Fourth Geneva Convention of 1949 providing for the protection of civilians in time of war or to comply with resolutions of the General Assembly, the Security Council and the Commission on Human Rights.

67. The desperate conditions in which the Arab population was living under Israeli occupation made it imperative for the Sub-Commission and the international community to take effective and urgent steps to halt Israel's destructive practices in the occupied territories and in Palestine.

68. In the occupied Syrian Golan, oppression and persecution of the population continued without respite and had even increased since the annexation of the territory in 1981. The Israeli forces were trying to force Syrian citizens from their land by destroying villages, hospitals and schools. Syrian nationals were denied their individual and collective rights and freedoms, they lived under martial law and were obliged to obey the orders of the Israeli military commander of the region, who could impose a curfew anywhere and at any time. Those who refused to comply were subjected to long periods of detention without trial during which they were treated badly. Nevertheless, the intifada of the Palestinian people and the heroic resistance of the people of the Syrian Golan and South Lebanon were a categorical rebuff to Israel's expansionist policy and its refusal to respect the Fourth Geneva Convention of 1949 or resolutions of the General Assembly, the Security Council, the Commission on Human Rights and the Sub-Commission condemning Israel and calling on it to put an end to human rights violations in the territories it was occupying.

69. In conclusion, he reaffirmed that occupation was in itself a gross violation of human rights and a threat to international peace and security.

70. Mrs. BLOCH (Minority Rights Group) said that in its statement the Group would not focus on any specific minority group as such, since in past years that had led to little of consequence. It would instead dwell on the link between human rights violations, in particular the denial of minority rights, and violent conflict. Although it was true that international peace and security were an essential condition for the enjoyment of human rights, the reverse was equally true; until that was understood and accepted, peace would not be found. Almost all violent conflicts throughout the world had been predicted by non-governmental organizations in reports to the Sub-Commission and the Commission on Human Rights. Despite their warnings on Yugoslavia, Somalia, Afghanistan and Iraq, the United Nations remained unable to provide effective methods to resolve disputes. The same was true of Tibet and East Timor, where the situation was bound to deteriorate unless the United Nations human rights bodies provided unambiguous support for their peoples' non-violent expression of their legitimate demands.

71. It was significant that in his Agenda for Peace (A/47/277), the Secretary-General made no mention of human rights or minority rights in relation to early warning and early action to prevent conflict. The dominant principle referred to was that of non-interference in internal affairs of States. Furthermore, United Nations human rights mechanisms were not mentioned as a source of early warning or an instrument for early action. The Commission on Human Rights, its Sub-Commission and the treaty bodies had a part to play in conflict prevention. It was up to those bodies to insist on the paramount importance of the enjoyment of human rights in the maintenance of international peace and security, they would have to emphasize their early warning and early action potential until it was generally recognized throughout the United Nations system.

72. The Secretary-General had reaffirmed in the same report the importance of the sovereign State as the fundamental entity of the international community. Although it was true that the United Nations structure was built on that principle, the consequence was that all nations and peoples were struggling for recognition as sovereign States. Too often in the past, that principle and the concern for non-interference in the internal affairs of other States had led to a failure by States members of the United Nations to resolve violent conflicts and to put an end to human rights violations. States forgot that the enjoyment of human rights was as important a principle in the Charter as that of non-interference. The United Nations could only play a role in peace-making if the parties to a conflict had the will to seek a peaceful solution. It was however clear that in the former Yugoslavia such a political will was lacking among those in a position to stop the fighting. Was the international community therefore to accept the immense human suffering the population was enduring there? The Sub-Commission would have to address that difficult question and find guidelines for action.

73. Despite its failure to make peace in certain areas, the international community must address the inevitable human suffering following conflicts. Many members of that community had, however, behaved disgracefully in that context, for example Yemen had denied entry to Somali refugees, and some west European countries had given only miserly help to people trying to escape fighting in the former Yugoslavia. Such countries should learn from the generosity of some African and Asian countries to refugees and displaced persons.

74. In conclusion, the Minority Rights Group recommended that the Sub-Commission should examine ways of addressing violations of human rights and providing minority rights within the United Nations system, consider possible ways of using the information gathered on human rights abuses to assist with early warning and early action, and take up the issue of the human rights of refugees and displaced persons, in particular those not covered by the 1951 Geneva Convention and its 1967 Protocol.

75. Mr. WIPFLER (Anglican Consultative Council) said that for the past 16 years the world had observed in virtual silence the genocide of the tiny nation of East Timor, where since its brutal invasion by Indonesia on 7 December 1975 one third of the population had been annihilated by the military. Security Council resolutions 384 (1975) and 389 (1976) concerning the Indonesian invasion and repression of East Timor had been ignored by the

nations that had forced Iraq's compliance with United Nations resolutions. The Government of Indonesia claimed that the Timorese had expressed their free choice for "integration" as the twenty-seventh province of Indonesia, but it had never allowed a referendum on the issue and resisted every suggestion that the people of East Timor be permitted to express their will through a dialogue which would include Portugal, the United Nations designated administrating Power.

76. The massacre at Dili on 12 November 1991, which the Indonesian authorities could not deny since it had been witnessed by foreign journalists and had left many dead and injured, had been reported to the Commission on Human Rights at its last session. Unfortunately, the sponsors of a draft resolution on the subject had withdrawn it on hearing that a government investigation was under way, that appropriate disciplinary measures would be taken, that civilians would be given a fair trial, and that the personal envoy of the Secretary-General would receive cooperation from the Indonesian Government, which would facilitate access by humanitarian and human rights organizations to East Timor. A similar draft resolution had also been withdrawn at the forty-third session of the Sub-Commission as a result of undertakings by the Indonesian Government to resolve the problems in the region. A series of events subsequent to the Commission's session had demonstrated the disdain of the Indonesian Government for universally recognized human rights and for the United Nations bodies that sought their implementation.

77. The promised investigation had resulted in a further display of the true nature of Indonesian justice. A few high-level military officers had been transferred and some lower-level military personnel tried and given prison sentences of 8 to 10 months for exceeding authority or ignoring instructions, whereas 13 Timorese who had been allegedly implicated in the non-violent demonstration had been sentenced - to up to 15 years in prison and in one case to life imprisonment. Furthermore, the families of the 90 persons reported as missing after the massacre still had no information on their fate, although it was currently believed that the security forces had executed them and disposed of their bodies. Although, in accordance with the agreement between the Indonesian Government and the Commission on Human Rights, the personal envoy of the Secretary-General, Dr. Amos Wako, had visited East Timor and Indonesia, he had been unable to meet witnesses of the Dili massacre because it was said that many of them had been compelled to sign statements that they would make no attempt to meet Mr. Wako, whose report had still not been released. Lastly, the Indonesian Government had further restricted access by humanitarian organizations, and needless to say foreign journalists, to East Timor.

78. According to reliable sources, the policy of genocide in East Timor was continuing. A new wave of arrests had taken place and those detained had been denied access to their families and lawyers and had been subjected to torture. The Sub-Commission must give serious consideration to the issue since it was time for Indonesia to understand that it too had an obligation to comply with internationally accepted standards of human rights.

79. Mrs. OZDEN (Centre Europe Tiers Monde - CETIM) said that CETIM was concerned by the silence that intentionally or otherwise, reigned over the flagrant deterioration of human rights in Madagascar during 16 years of dictatorship.

80. That deterioration had taken the form of the curtailment of the freedom of the press and freedom of association, assassination and summary execution and arbitrary arrest and detention followed by inhuman treatment and torture. Massacres had occurred in 1991. The forces of law and order had opened fire on people taking part in the peaceful "freedom march" in Antananarivo on 10 August 1991 leaving 14 dead, 188 injured, and many missing. There had been similar occurences in a number of provinces but nowhere had the brutal acts led to legal proceedings. Despite the Government's promises, no inquiry had been held and the freedom from punishment enjoyed by the perpetrators fostered repression. CETIM therefore called on the Sub-Commission to recommend that the Commission on Human Rights should consider the human rights situation in Madagascar at its forty-ninth session with a view to appointing an independent expert to investigate the massacres that had taken place in the country in 1991. A document on the matter, signed by several non-governmental organizations, would be submitted to the officers of the Sub-Commission.

81. In the Western Sahara, the modest United Nations force had been unable to ensure observance of the fundamental rights of the Saharan people. According to witnesses, Saharans had been threatened with reprisals if they contacted members of MINURSO. Morocco had also engaged in mass displacement of peoples after the United Nations had arrived to supervise the cease-fire in force since 6 September 1991. The cease-fire had already been broken on 102 occasions, in 97 cases by Morocco, according to the latest report by the Secretary-General on Western Sahara. However, it was clear that only the implementation of the agreed peace plan could put an end to the human rights abuses in that region.

82. The situation in Rwanda continued to cause considerable concern despite the initiation of the peace process in April 1992. The Belgian League for the Defence of Human Rights had reported that Tutsis had been arrested and executed by gangs of armed civilians with the tacit support of the army and the civil and judicial authorities. Furthermore, according to reliable sources, a number of incidents at Bugesera in the south-east of the country had resulted in 300 casualties.

83. In the 13 Kurdish provinces of Turkey, the state of emergency was still in force; the Turkish Government had suspended the implementation of the European Convention on Human Rights for that region. Repression of the Kurds had increased since Newroz, the Kurdish national festival, which had been turned into a bloodbath by the massive intervention of the forces of law and order. The daily newspaper Hürriyat of 4 August 1992, reported that 84 people had been summarily executed since the beginning of the year, 8 of them journalists, including the correspondent of the daily newspaper Sabah, who had been killed during the demonstrations at Newroz. The plight of persons defending human rights was hardly better; Sidik Tan, a member of the Executive Committee of the Human Rights Association at Batman, had been assassinated on 20 June 1992.

84. Lastly, CETIM called the Sub-Commission's attention to the alarming situation that had prevailed in Haiti since 30 September 1991, when Jean-Bertrand Aristide, the first democratically elected President of the country, had been overthrown. Over 3,000 people had been killed since the coup d'état. The principal target of the army and the tonton Macoute were the members of the Roman Catholic Church in Haiti, who were being spied on, arrested, humiliated and tortured because they sided with the people's struggle to return to a state of law. It was astonishing under the circumstances that the representative of the Vatican, Monsignor Baldisieri, had been present at the investiture of the new Prime Minister, Mr. Marc Bazin, whose appointment had been condemned by the international community. Furthermore, many journalists had been killed in cold blood or arrested and tortured, while others, who had been harassed and threatened, had gone underground. CETIM was also very concerned at the plight of the Haitian boat people and by United States policy towards them. The ruling of the Supreme Court of the United States of 1 August 1992 authorizing the Bush administration to continue the forced repatriation of Haitians intercepted at sea without considering their request for asylum was objectionable. That policy had also been condemned as shameful and mean by the New York Times of 3 August 1992.

85. Mrs. PARKER (International Educational development - IED) said that IED paid special attention to compliance with humanitarian law in situations of armed conflict and to the development of humanitarian law. It had noted a tendency to condemn victims for defending their rights instead of the governments violating those rights. It called on the international community to be even-handed in addressing the situations IED would present.

86. In Myanmar, not only had the regime been reluctant to hand over to the parties that had won the elections in May 1990, it had taken the war in which it was engaged against various national groups as a pretext for curtailing human rights. It had attacked the civilian population, killed and tortured prisoners of war, used ethnic nationals as porters under slave labour conditions, and moved ethnic nationals out of their traditional territories to replace them with Burmese. Those were war crimes. IED urged the Sub-Commission's Special Rapporteur on Myanmar to address specifically the armed conflicts in the country in the light of the international principle of self-determination and the rules of armed conflict.

87. In Sri Lanka, it was dismaying that despite the statement by the Commission on Human Rights urging compliance with humanitarian law in the Government's war against Tamil forces, and the sincere efforts of several countries to mediate, the Sri Lankan Government had persisted in its war crimes and refused to address the root causes of the conflict in the interests of achieving a negotiated settlement. The conflict was being used by the Government to justify its abuse of human rights and humanitarian law. It tried to persuade the international community that Tamil demands were "unreasonable" in order to divert attention from Tamil rights, including the right of self-determination, and its own excesses (there had been 6,000 disappearances in the east of the country since 1990, attacks on hospitals were still being made and the continuing blockade in the north had prevented food and medical supplies protected under humanitarian law from reaching needy people). Pushed to the limit, Tamils were rightly asking why their

nationalist yearnings should be less seriously defended than those of other peoples. The Sub-Commission should urge a cease-fire and genuine negotiations between the parties to the conflict.

88. The situation in Kashmir had been brought to the attention of the Sub-Commission and the Commission on Human Rights by the IED on a number of occasions. Not only had there been long-time oppression of the people, the Indian authorities were refusing to hold the plebiscite mandated by the United Nations. It was understandable that the Kashmiris should have taken to arms to defend their rights. IED urged the Sub-Commission to call on the Security Council to ensure the holding of the promised plebiscite and to remind the Government of India and the armed opposition of their human rights obligations.

89. In Guatemala, the repression of the people by successive Governments had led to opposition forces taking up their defence. The war set the majority Maya people against the minority oppressing them. It could accordingly be viewed not as a rebellion but as a war of national liberation against a racist regime under the terms of Protocol I additional to the Geneva Conventions. Regardless of the term applicable, neither the Government nor the international community had paid due respect to the fundamental human rights standards applicable to all armed conflicts (protection of captured or wounded combatants, protection of the civilian population, objective classification of military operations and protection of humanitarian relief). In that context, furthermore, the Government endeavoured to persuade international opinion that the Guatemalan people were asking too much in their quest for full enjoyment of human rights. IED urged the Sub-Commission to recognize that the Guatemalan people were only seeking their due, to condemn the continuing, generalized abuse of humanitarian standards and human rights soundly, and to request the expert appointed by the Commission to pay particular attention to objective analysis of the conflict.

90. In Turkey, IED considered that the Kurdish people had a strong claim to self-determination and that their conflict with Turkey was a war of national liberation. However the conflict was described, the Turkish Government was failing dismally to comply with minimum human rights standards: armed attacks were being made on the civilian population, prisoners of war were denied their rights and were frequently tortured and killed although no longer combatants, and humanitarian relief was restricted. The Sub-Commission should strongly condemn those violations.

91. As for Somalia, the situation was difficult to assess, but available reports indicated that the international community ought to respond in the strongest possible way. IED urged the Sub-Commission to request the Secretary-General to coordinate and carry out initiatives to ensure the return of peace to Somalia and the survival of its people as a matter of the highest priority.

92. IED had prepared a report on Bosnia and another on Croatia, which were available to members of the Sub-Commission. It urged the international community to base its action on the requests from the peoples affected and their Governments.

93. Mr. EIDE, calling attention to violations not only by Governments but also by opposition forces, recalled that he had spoken earlier of the dangers of ethno-nationalism, whether pursued by majorities in power or by minorities within multi-ethnic States. Ethno-nationalism tended to cause exclusion and discrimination, it was often associated with racism and xenophobia and could lead to brutal violence. One of its most terrible aspects was "ethnic cleansing", the displacement of persons because of their ethnic origin. That could be done overtly, as in Bosnia, or covertly and under the pretext of protecting the safety of the rejected group, as had happened in the Transcaucasian region, or through acts of terror which spread fear among members of the ethnic or religious group concerned and impelled them to flee the territory. Hence the most important aspect of the decision adopted by the Sub-Commission the previous day was probably its total and unqualified condemnation of the policies and practices of ethnic cleansing. It was essential to find appropriate countermeasures to all forms of that scourge, a task he would be pursuing in his future work on minority issues.

94. In its decision, the Sub-Commission had demanded that those who committed crimes against humanitarian standards should be brought to justice, regardless of whether they were government or irregular groups. That applied not only to the former Yugoslavia but to other situations as well.

95. The international community must find ways to deal with ethno-nationalism, whether practised by Governments or opposition groups, and should refuse to accept the argument that violations of minimum humanitarian standards by one side justified violations by the opposing side.

96. Moderate parties on both sides ought to seek solutions to the issues that divided them; that presupposed political participation by all, recognition of religious, ethnic or linguistic pluralism, economic and social justice, and investigation of the causes of violence, which could serve to redress genuine grievances.

97. In many cases extremists were found among members of the security forces; a pertinent task for the human rights community, including non-governmental organizations, would be to monitor the means by which Governments controlled the extremists in their midst, including "vigilantes" and death squads acting with government acquiescence. It was also important to monitor the human rights policies of opposition groups, including the way they restrained their members from violating minimum humanitarian standards. Document E/CN.4/Sub.2/1991/55 contained a consolidated set of principles drawn from existing human rights law and humanitarian law that were applicable in all circumstances, including armed conflict, internal disturbances and public emergency, and were open to no derogation of any kind.

98. Such minimum humanitarian standards ought to be respected by all persons, groups and authorities, irrespective of their legal status. Members of opposition groups should be aware of them and be held accountable for any violation in exactly the same way as members of the security forces; Governments were not entitled to deviate from such standards even when a state of emergency had been declared. Some forms of derogation, like some forms on anti-terrorist legislation in fact opened the way for terrorism by allowing abuse of those standards.

99. Turning to conditions in individual countries, he pointed out that terrorism often stemmed from the failure of Governments to respect human rights. That had been the case in East Timor, where violence had become endemic, as the recent killings at Dili showed; no solution would be found until a referendum had been held under international supervision.

100. In Iran too, the main cause of violence stemmed from the Government, which was influenced by religious extremists; he hoped that the Sub-Commission would once more clearly condemn the policies being pursued, which obviously fell below minimum humanitarian standards, as had emerged clearly from Mr. Galindo Pohl's report.

101. In Guatemala also, at least part of the violence had its origin in the unacceptable policies of earlier Governments against the indigenous population. The 1990 Oslo Agreement had initiated a peace process, but extremists were once again at work, some within the security forces or under their protection, to prevent the peace process by means of terrorist acts violating minimum humanitarian standards. Unfortunately, the Government had not yet been able to bring those responsible to justice.

102. In Peru, a murderous opposition group was carrying out terrorist actions. Those acts needed to be monitored, but the Government was not dispensed from complying with and enforcing observance of minimum humanitarian standards as well as ensuring that emergency legislation met such standards. The fight against terrorism could not be won by terrorism.

103. In Sri Lanka, the populist exploitation of Singhala ethno-nationalism and the unacceptable tolerance of Singhala violence in 1983 had been partly responsible for the present situation, but subsequent developments - the hardening attitudes and intolerable policies of the LTTE (Tamil Tigers) - had complicated matters. However, the willingness shown by the representative of Sri Lanka to cooperate with human rights bodies gave grounds for hope. Both sides would have to be closely monitored to ensure, for example, that all persons responsible for violations were brought to justice.

104. In Turkey, the new Government had improved its commitment to human rights; it should be encouraged to bring its practices further into conformity with its intentions. The Kurdish issue, however, remained a serious problem. In the past, Turkey had made major errors in its policy towards ethnic minorities; that should be recognized and steps taken to initiate dialogue to rectify it. Admittedly, some elements of the Kurdish movement engaged in what could be considered terrorist acts, frequently with civilians as victims, as the observer for Turkey had pointed out; unfortunately, members of the security forces were also guilty of such acts and enjoyed immunity from punishment - a point of considerable importance.

105. In Colombia, a peace process had been initiated which included the new Constitution establishing many human rights. Nevertheless, serious violations continued to be carried out by extremists seeking to destroy progress towards constitutionalism, guerrillas, drug traffickers and security forces attached to the Government. However, the Andean Commission of Jurists had endeavoured to find out who had perpetrated the violations and concluded that most had been carried out by the security forces. Other non-governmental organizations

might well follow that example, with assistance from international human rights bodies in the form of advisory services or technical assistance. By identifying the culprits, those investigations demystified the role of violent opposition movements as a justification for violations by government forces, and would help democratic Governments that wished to discipline their security forces.

106. In China the administration of justice left much to be desired; in Tibet, in particular, the Chinese Government's refusal to accept genuine cultural autonomy was the cause of the protests that were subsequently harshly repressed.

107. In western Europe, non-governmental organizations should remain alert to the danger represented by failure to punish racist attacks.

108. In conclusion, the way forward entailed a quest for peace and reciprocal tolerance on the one hand and resolute action to end immunity from punishment for violations of minimum standards on the other.

109. Daw YIN YIN MYINT (Observer for Myanmar), speaking in exercise of the right of reply, categorically rejected the allegations against Myanmar as unfounded and clearly emanating from outside sources hostile to Myanmar and with ulterior political motives. The porters used by the Myanmar armed forces to transport military equipment were recruited after consultation with local authorities on the basis of criteria established by legislation in force since 1907, namely, that they should be unemployed, physically fit and their wages should be agreed in advance. Furthermore, such porters were never required to accompany troops to a combat area, nor were they exposed to danger, particularly since the Government of Myanmar had from April 1992 suspended military operations against armed terrorists or insurgents with a view to establishing amity among all national races and to strengthening national unity and solidarity.

110. She also drew attention to the national programme for resettlement in satellite towns which was intended to provide shelter for the homeless and improve the living environment of the poorest segments of society. The Independent Expert on Myanmar had indicated that he had been favourably impressed by the projects for building new satellite towns, which he considered beneficial for the population.

111. Lastly, contrary to what had been alleged, the Myanmar army had never been a mercenary force. The Myanmar armed forces had fought beside the people in the struggle for national independence, in which many indigenous ethnic groups had participated, and had always served the interests of Myanmar loyally and faithfully. It was a voluntary army of highly disciplined members pledged to conduct themselves in conformity with the prescribed code of ethics and to respect the cultural traditions and customs of local people.

112. Mr. SEZGIN (Observer for Turkey), speaking in exercise of the right of reply, said that the three non-governmental organizations that had criticized the attitude of the Turkish authorities to the PKK Kurdish movement (Kurdistan Workers' Party) had merely reiterated the arguments of that terrorist

organization. Like the PKK, they refused to acknowledge the progress made by democracy in Turkey in order to justify that organization's criminal activities.

113. In fact, as far as Turkey was concerned, the Kurdish question was a false issue, since all citizens enjoyed equal treatment before the law, equal freedoms and equal access to democracy. However, the population of south-eastern Anatolia were undeniably confronted with a terrorist organization that since 1984 had killed over 4,000 people, 2,000 of them civilians, including women and children, from the region itself. The PKK was considered a criminal and terrorist organization not only by the majority of the Kurds themselves and by the Turkish Government, but also by a number of Governments that had studied its activities.

114. Reference had been made to the events during Newroz on 21 March 1992. It should be noted that the PKK had been engaged since January in turning that traditional festival into a so-called popular uprising. The only persons present had been women and children who had been brought by force and members of the PKK itself, against whom the security forces had taken the requisite measures. The event had had the merit of demonstrating yet again that the PKK enjoyed no support among the mass of the population, who refused categorically to identify with that terrorist group and its relentless violence. How could the citizens of a liberal democracy be attracted to an obsolete and totalitarian ideology opposed to democracy, human rights and fundamental freedoms? The PKK's rejection of democracy and human rights was not merely seen in its bloodthirsty acts but also as a result of the freedom of the press in Turkey. He recalled, in conclusion, that as well as the nihilist PKK there was another terrorist group that took its inspiration from Kurdish religious fundamentalism; the armed struggle for influence in which the two groups were engaged had resulted in many killings.

The meeting rose at 1.05 p.m.